



Historic Preservation Services

Community Development & Neighborhood Services

281 North College Avenue
P.O. Box 580
Fort Collins, CO 80522.0580

970.416.4250

preservation@fcgov.com

fcgov.com/historicpreservation

REPORT OF ALTERATIONS TO DESIGNATED RESOURCE

Site Number/Address: 1113 Mathews St.

Laurel School National Register Historic District

ISSUED: 9/21/2022

Magnolia Rose Rentals LLC
707 W. Magnolia St.
Fort Collins, CO 80521

Dear Marc Leblond and Rachel Bedard:

This report is to document proposed alterations to the Harley Kimble Residence, at 1113 Mathews St., pursuant to Fort Collins Municipal Code Chapter 14, [Article IV](#), made by the Historic Preservation Commission at their September 21, 2022 meeting. A copy of this report may be forwarded to the Colorado Office of Archaeology and Historic Preservation.

More specifically, the Commission commented on the following work items:

1. Demolition of the 1905 historic house and garage
2. Construction of a new single-family dwelling

Note Regarding Demolition of Historic Structures: Generally, the demolition of properties that contribute to designated historic districts such as the Laurel School Historic District, do not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. However, because the historic property is not a City Landmark and not protected under City Code, the analysis below does not address Standards 1-7 as those pertain to preservation of the historic structure. The analysis focuses only on Standards 8, 9, and 10 as they relate to new construction in the Laurel School Historic District.

Applicable Code Standard	Summary of Code Requirement and Analysis (Rehabilitation)	Standard Met (Y/N)
SOI #1	<i>A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships;</i>	N
SOI #2	<i>The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.</i>	N

SOI #3	<i>Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.</i>	N
SOI #4	<i>Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.</i>	N
SOI #5	<i>Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.</i>	N
SOI #6	<i>Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.</i>	N
SOI #7	<i>Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.</i>	N/A
SOI #8	<p><i>Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.</i></p> <p>The applicant understands that should excavation for the new construction reveal archaeological resources, they shall be protected and preserved in place and that mitigation measures must be undertaken should they be disturbed.</p>	Y


<p>SOI #9</p>	<p><i>New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Demolition of Historic Structures – The demolition of the historic residence and its associated garage do not meet this Standard. However, it should be noted that the applicant does intend to attempt to salvage materials either for re-use on the site or donation and divert some materials from the landfill through recycling; this includes: the oak and maple hardwood flooring, the windows, the boiler; any concrete, Douglas fir dimensional lumber, material from a walnut tree removed from the property in 2012, bricks from the chimney, and porcelain from toilets and sinks. 2. New Construction in Historic District – <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Compatibility - Overall, the plans for the new single-family house are not sufficiently compatible with surrounding historic buildings and the larger historic district. Although the proposed new house would have setbacks similar to nearby properties, the new construction is larger than many other homes in the district, especially compared to the 1-1.5 story houses in the area like the house being demolished. The scale of the proposed house is not compatible with the Laurel School Historic District. <p>The new house alludes to design elements from nearby homes, but modern architectural features weaken the compatibility of the new house with the neighborhood. Regarding windows, the design includes much more glass fronting the street than is seen on other houses in the area, and the solid-to-void ratio is not reflective of the context. Additionally, the second-story balcony/patio is a modern design feature that is not consistent with other homes in the district.</p> <p>In terms of materials, the primary cladding is clapboard siding, but there are also modern materials used including the cement fiber siding, the charred/stained vertical wood siding within the porch inset areas and south elevation, as well as the standing seam metal roof.</p> 	<p>N</p>
----------------------	---	-----------------

	The alley-loaded garage structure includes two bays and incorporates modern wall and roof materials like those on the house (charred/stained wood siding, standing seam metal roof).	
SOI #10	<p><i>New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.</i></p> <p>Demolition of the historic building constitutes a permanent alteration that destroys historic fabric and impacts the Laurel School Historic District through the loss of a contributing resource.</p>	N

The Commission found that the proposed demolition does not meet the criteria and standards in Chapter 14, Article IV of the Fort Collins Municipal Code. Additionally, the new single-family residence does not meet Standard 9 regarding new construction because of the lack of compatibility between the new house and the historic district. It is expected that the property will no longer contribute to the district. This will prohibit current and future owners from leveraging financial incentives for historic preservation and reduces the proportion of contributing resources in the Laurel School Historic District.

Notice of the completion of this report has been forwarded to building and zoning staff to facilitate the processing of any permits that are needed for the work. Please note that all ensuing work must conform to the approved plans. Any non-conforming alterations are subject to stop-work orders, denial of Certificate of Occupancy, and restoration requirements and penalties. If you have any questions regarding the Commission's report, or if we may be of any assistance, please do not hesitate to contact our office at preservation@fcgov.com or 970-224-6078.

Sincerely,

DocuSigned by:

 9/23/2022
 0D881243679D4DA...

Jim Rose, Co-Chair
 Historic Preservation Commission