

Historic Preservation Services

Community Development & Neighborhood Services 281 North College Avenue P.O. Box 580 Fort Collins, CO 80522.0580

970.416.4250 preservation@fcgov.com fcgov.com/historicpreservation

REPORT OF ALTERATIONS TO DESIGNATED RESOURCE Site Number/Address: 821 Whedbee Street Laurel School National Register Historic District ISSUED: June 16, 2021

Allison and Alexander Klug 821 Whedbee Street Fort Collins, CO 80524

Dear Mr. and Mrs. Klug:

This report is to document the summary of effects from proposed alterations to the Ferdinand and Lillie Zabel Property at 821 Whedbee Street, pursuant to Fort Collins Municipal Code Chapter 14, <u>Article IV</u>, made by the Historic Preservation Commission at their June 16, 2021 meeting. A copy of this report may be forwarded to the Colorado Office of Archaeology and Historic Preservation.

More specifically, the Commission commented on the following work items:

- 1. Demolition of the existing roof framing, front-gabled front porch, and certain elements of the exterior walls.
- 2. Renovation to include construction a second story and modification of the building from its historic Arts-and-Crafts period style to a neo-Victorian design.
- 3. Addition onto the rear of the property.

Applicable Code Standard	Summary of Code Requirement and Analysis (Rehabilitation)	Standard Met (Y/N)
SOI #1	A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships; The property will remain in residential use.	Y
SOI #2	The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.	N
	The Zabel Property is a modest Craftsman Cottage built in c.1921 that currently contributes to the Laurel School Historic District, listed in the National Register of Historic Places in 1980. It is characterized by its single-story, front-gabled	

	 configuration and front-gabled front porch with matching roof slope, stepped down from the main roof by about two feet. It has lapboard siding and multi-light wood windows on all elevations. Nearly all of the distinctive features of the property are proposed to be removed as part of the renovation. The roof form and building massing will be demolished to bring the one-story building up to a two-story. The distinctive front porch will be demolished to attach a full-width, shed roof porch. All windows will be replaced and window patterns and openings significantly modified. The only remaining historic material on the exterior appears to be the lapboard siding which will remain on most of the first floor. 	
	historic district's period of significance (approximately 1875-	
SOI #3	 1940). The project does not meet this Standard. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken. The property was historically a Craftsman-style building, constructed during the Arts and Crafts movement in approximately 1921. The proposed project completely alters the presented architectural style and period from Arts and Crafts to Victorian, creating a neo-Victorian, two-story temple-front with some anachronistic Craftsman elements like brackets along the eaves. The project does not meet this Standard. 	N
SOI #4	 Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved. Permit records indicate the following history of alterations: 1928 – rear porch added 1942 – reroofing 1943 – porch enclosed 1994 – reroof 2012 - reroof There do not appear to be historic alterations that need to be considered as part of this project. 	N/A

SOI #5	Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved. As noted in the analysis for Standard 2, nearly all of the features that characterize the property as a one-story Craftsman Cottage built in the 1873 Avery Plat neighborhood in c.1921 are being removed as part of the project. The only historic material to remain is the lapboard cladding on most of the first floor addition. As a result of the extensive loss of historic materials, features, finishes, construction techniques, and examples of early-twentieth century Arts-and-Crafts craftsmanship, this project does not meet this Standard.	Ν
SOI #6	Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence. The property appears to be in overall excellent condition, with minimal wear-and-tear or rotting on the wood features, including the windows. None of these features are in a condition to justify replacement. Due to the extensive removal of historic features that are in good to excellent condition, this project does not meet this Standard.	Ν
SOI #7	Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.	N/A
SOI #8	Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken. Based on the already-disturbed nature of the property, the likelihood of significant archaeological discoveries being made during the project is low.	N/A
SOI #9	New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment. The exterior alterations to the property, specifically removal of the historic windows, porch, and roof framing, construction of a second story on a home that was historically one-story, and modification of exterior styling from Arts-and-Crafts to largely neo-Victorian in nature, collectively do not meet this Standard.	Ν

	While the new work is differentiated from the old through the use of vertical beadboard siding, the project does not meet the other two primary requirements of this Standard due to the extensive demolition, removal, and alteration of historic features.	
	 <u>Compatibility</u> – Exterior alterations and additions onto historic buildings can meet the Standards, but typically need to retain historic materials and design features, including overall massing, scale, and configuration of the historic building. Alterations and additions should be clustered on the rear of the property and be designed in a sympathetic manner to the historic building. The demolition of the roof framing, addition of a second story, and introduction of inappropriate materials and stylistic features for an Arts-and-Crafts building are not compatible with the building's overall character as a small Craftsman Cottage. <u>Subordinate to Historic Building</u> – Exterior alterations and additions should be subordinate to the historic building, being located on a side or rear elevation, and generally smaller in scale than the historic building. A second-story addition onto a small Craftsman residence cannot meet this Standard, nor can the demolition of a character-defining feature like a front porch, or the majority of historic material in the building. 	
SOI #10	New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.As noted above, the alterations and demolition of character- defining features are extensive. They will result in permanent loss of historic character and are not reversible, requiring significant demolition and reconstruction to return the building to its historic configuration and design. This project does not meet this Standard.	N

The Commission found that the proposed work, overall, does not meet the criteria and standards in Chapter 14, <u>Article IV</u> of the Fort Collins Municipal Code. Notice of the completion of this report has been forwarded to building and zoning staff to facilitate the processing of any permits that are needed for the work.

The Commission also recommends that as a result of the project, the building will no longer qualify as an historic resource due to significant loss of the property's character-defining features as a Craftsman Cottage built in the 1920s, during a significant period of residential growth in the then southeast portion of Fort Collins. Loss of historic status will result in permanent loss of access to financial incentives available to historic property owners, and further diminishes the overall historic integrity of the Laurel School Historic District.

Please note that all ensuing work must conform to the approved plans. Any non-conforming alterations are subject to stop-work orders, denial of Certificate of Occupancy, and restoration requirements and penalties.

If you have any questions regarding this report, or if we may be of any assistance, please do not hesitate to contact staff at (970) 416-4250 or preservation@fcgov.com.

Sincerely,

Moch

Meg Dunn, Chair Historic Preservation Commission



Design Review Application Historic Preservation Division

Fill this form out for all applications regarding designated historic buildings within the city limits of the City of Fort Collins. Review is required for these properties under Chapter 14, <u>Article IV</u> of the Fort Collins Municipal Code.

Applicant Information

Applicant's Name	Daytime Phone	Evening Phone
Mailing Address (for receiving application-related correspondence)		State Zip Code
Email		
Property Information (put N/A if owner is applicant)		
Owner's Name	Daytime Phone	Evening Phone
Mailing Address (for receiving application-related correspondence)		State Zip Code
Email		

Project Description

Provide an overview of your project. Summarize work elements, schedule of completion, and other information as necessary to explain your project.

The following attachments are REQUIRED:

Complete Application for Design Review

- □ Detailed Scope of Work (and project plans, if available)
- Color photos of existing conditions

Reminders: Complete application would need all of checklist items as well as both pages of this document.

Detailed scope of work should include measurements of existing and proposed.

Please note: if the proposal includes partial or full demolition of an existing building or structure, a separate demolition application will need to be approved.

Additional documentation may be required to adequately depict the project, such as plans, elevations, window study, or mortar analysis. If there is insufficient documentation on the property, the applicant may be required to submit an intensive-level survey form (at the applicant's expense).

Note: City Preservation staff modified the table below to be visible and conform with exterior items subject to the City's historic preservation review authority under Chapter 14, Article IV.

Detail of Proposed Rehabilitation Work (*Required)

If your project includes multiple features (e.g. roof repair and foundation repair), you must describe each feature separately and provide photographs and other information on each feature.

Feature A Name:	
Describe property feature and its condition:	Describe proposed work on feature:
Feature B Name:	
Describe property feature and its condition:	Describe proposed work on feature:
	Describe proposed work on feature:

Use Additional Worksheets as needed.

Required Additional information

The following items must be submitted with this completed application. Digital submittals preferred for photographs, and for other items where possible.

At least one current photo for each side of the house. Photo files or prints shall be named/labeled with applicant name and elevation. For example, smitheast.jpg, smithwest.jpg, etc. If submitted as prints, photos shall be labeled

Photos for each feature as described in the section "Detail of Proposed Rehabilitation Work". Photo files or prints shall be named or labeled with applicant name and feature letter. For example, smitha1.jpg, smitha2.jpg, smithb.jpg, smithc.jpg, etc.

Depending on the nature of the project, one or more of the following items shall be submitted. Your contractor should provide these items to you for attachment to this loan application.

- Drawing with dimensions.
- Product specification sheet(s).
- Description of materials included in the proposed work.
- Color sample(s) or chip(s) of all proposed paint colors.

□ **Partial or full demolition** is a part of this project.

Partial demolition could include scopes such as taking off existing rear porches to create space for a new addition or removing an existing wall or demolishing a roof. If you are taking away pieces of the existing residence, you are likely undergoing some partial demolition.

Signature of Applicant

Date





KLUG RESIDENCE on WHEDBEE STREET



OWNER

INTERIOR DESIGNER

STRUCTURAL

PROJECT DIRECTORY

ALEX & ALLISON KLUG 821 WHEDBEE STREET, FORT COLLINS, CO 80524

FORGE + BOW DWELLINGS ARCHITECTURAL DESIGNER 116 N COLLEGE AVE, SUITE #5, FORT COLLINS, CO 80524 970) 797-2354 aul@forgeandbow.com CONTACT: Paul Esposti FORGE + BOW DWELLINGS CONTRACTOR 116 N COLLEGE AVE, SUITE #5, FORT COLLINS, CO 80524 (970) 797-2354

jordan@forgeandbow.com CONTACT: Jordan Obermann FORGE + BOW DWELLINGS L16 N COLLEGE AVE, SUITE #5, FORT COLLINS, CO 80524 (970) 797-2354 iv@forgeandbow.com CONTACT: Liv Blumberg

TD STRUCTURAL ENGINEERING 2909 OXFORD COURT, FORT COLLINS, CO 80525 970) 372- 1140 endyd@tdstructural.com

CONTACT: Wendy Dworak

VICINITY MAP E PLUM ST -----821 WHEDBEE STREET -----LOCUST ST

DRAWING INDEX

ARCHITECTURE

A0.0	INDEX SHEET
- A0.1 -	ARCHITECTURAL SITE PLAN
-A1.0 -	- LOWER LEVEL PLAN
	MAIN LEVEL PLAN
<u>_A1.2</u>	UPPER LEVEL PLAN
<u> </u>	LOWER LEVEL DEMO PLAN
<u> </u>	MAIN LEVEL DEMO PLAN
- A3.0 -	- LOWER LEVEL REFLECTED CEILING PLAN
- A3.1 -	MAIN LEVEL REFLECTED CEILING PLAN
- A3.2	UPPER LEVEL REFLECTED CEILING PLAN
- A4.0 -	ROOF PLAN
A5.0	EXTERIOR ELEVATIONS
A5.1	EXTERIOR ELEVATIONS

INTERIORS

STRUCTURAL

APRIL 12, 2021 **KLUG RESIDENCE** SYSTEM NOTES 821 WHEDBEE STREET DISCLAIMER: SYSTEM NOTES ARE MEANT TO BE A BASIS OF DESIGN - CONTRACTOR(S) FORT COLLINS, CO 80524 ULTIMATELY RESPONSIBLE FOR THE STRUCTURAL AND OTHERWISE INTEGRITY OF THE PRESCRIBED SYTEMS DESCRIBED BELOW **ROOFS R1** ASPHALT SHINGLE ROOF ASSEMBLY • COMPOSITE ASPHALT SHINGLE ROOFING, OVER • TITANIUM UNDERLAYMENT PER MANUFACTURER, • ICE AND WATER MEMBRANE LAYER FOR EAVES TO 3'-0" INSIDE EXTERIOR BUILDING FACE MEASURED HORIZONTALLY AND VALLEYS W/ METAL FLASHING (MIN. 24 GA. GALV. STEEL) AT VALLEYS AND ABUTTING WALLS PER SMACNA **RECOMMENDATIONS, ON** • ROOF DECK SHEATHING PER STRUCT, OVER • WOOD FRAMING, RE: STRUCT MIN. R-49 INSULATION OVER CONDITIONED SPACES R2 METAL ROOF ASSEMBLY: STANDING SEAM PREFINISHED METAL ROOFING, OVER • TITANIUM UNDERLAYMENT PER MANUFACTURER, • ICE AND WATER MEMBRANE LAYER w/ METAL FLASHING (MIN. 24 GA. GALV. STEEL) AT VALLEYS AND ABUTTING WALLS PER SMACNA RECOMMENDATIONS, AND AT EAVES EXTENDING 36" BEYOND OUTSIDE FACE OF STUD, ON • ROOF DECK SHEATHING, RE: STRUCT, OVER www.forgeandbow.com • WOOD FRAMING, RE: STRUCT, 116 N College Avenue, Suite #5, Fort Collins, CO • MIN. R-49 INSULATION OVER CONDITIONED SPACES 80524 ph: 970.797.2354 **R3 FASCIA ASSEMBLY**: • 1x6 TREATED ENGINEERED WD STRAND SUBSTRATE, OVER • 1X12 TREATED ENGINEERED WD STRAND SUBSTRATE. OVER • AIR & WEATHER BARRIER, TAPE ALL SEAMS & PENETRATIONS, FLASH AS REQ'D PER MANUFACTURER INSTRUCTIONS EXTERIOR WALLS W1 VERTICAL LAP SIDING ASSEMBLY: • TREATED ENGINEERED WD STRAND SUBSTRATE, 3/8" GROOVE @ 8" O.C, OVER • AIR & WEATHER BARRIER, TAPE ALL SEAMS & PENETRATIONS, FLASH OPENINGS PER MANUFACTURER INSTRUCTIONS, OVER UNBOUND • 1/2" NOM. OSB SHEATHING, RE: STRUCT, OVER 2x6 NOM. WOOD STUD FRAMING, • R-21 MIN. CLOSED CELL SPRAY FOAM INSULATION • 1 LAYER 1/2" GYPSUM BD, TEXTURED AND PAINTED RE: INTERIORS W2 CEDER SHAKE ASSEMBLY: • INDIVIDUAL CEDER SHAKE SIDING, STAINED/SEALED, OVER • - BALANCE OF WALL TYPE W1. W3 BEADBOARD ASSEMBLY: • BEADBOARD PANEL SIDING, OVER • - BALANCE OF WALL TYPE W1. W4 BRICK VENEER ASSEMBLY: • FULL BRICK VENEER, FILL ALL JOINTS WITH MORTAR, TOOLED & FINISHED USE PREFORMED OUTSIDE CORNERS OF VARYING SIZES • FULLY BUTTER THE BACKS OF STONES SCHEMATIC DESIGN • TUCK POINT ALL JOINTS FULL w/ MORTAR, TOOLED & FINISHED, OVER PORTLAND CEMENT SETTING BED, OVER • GALVANIZED METAL LATH ATTACHED W/ GALVANIZED SELF-FURRING NAILS THRU SHEATHING TO STUDS, OVER No. Description • 1 LAYER 30# BUILDING FELT SLIP SHEET, OVER ISSUED FOR REVIEW • TYVEK HOMEWRAP AIR & WEATHER BARRIER, TAPE ALL SEAMS, ON BALANCE OF WALL TYPE W1. W5 GARAGE LAP SIDING ASSEMBLY: • SMOOTH CEMENTITIOUS, MAX. 5" REVEAL LAP SIDING, OVER • AIR & WEATHER BARRIER, TAPE ALL SEAMS & PENETRATIONS, FLASH OPENINGS PER MANUFACTURER INSTRUCTIONS, OVER • 1 1/2" R-5 CONTINUOUS RIGID INSULATION • 1/2" NOM. OSB SHEATHING, RE: STRUCT, OVER 2x6 NOM. WOOD STUD FRAMING, No. Description • R-21 MIN. CLOSED CELL SPRAY FOAM INSULATION • 1 LAYER 1/2" GYPSUM BD, TEXTURED AND PAINTED RE: INTERIORS <u>FLOORS</u> F1 WOOD FRAMED ASSEMBLY: • FINISH FLOORING RE: SELECTION SHEETS, OVER • SHEATHING, RE: STRUCT, OVER SOLID WEB WOOD TJI FLOOR JOISTS PER STRUCT DRAWINGS-NOTFOR DRAWINGSTRUCTION • R-13 ACOUSTIC BATT INSUL. AT BOTTOM OF EA. JOIST SPACE. F2 RADIANT HEAT/WOOD FRAMED ASSEMBLY: • FINISH FLOORING RE: SELECTION SHEETS, OVER • 1 1/2" GYPCRETE TOPPING w/ HYDRONIC RADIANT TUBE HEATING SYSTEM PER MECH, ON • FLOOR DECK SHEATHING PER STRUCT, OVER SOLID WEB WOOD TJI FLOOR JOISTS PER STRUCT • R-13 ACOUSTIC BATT INSUL. AT BOTTOM OF EA. JOIST SPACE. F3 RADIANT HEAT/SLAB ON GRADE ASSEMBLY: • FINISH FLOOR RE: SELECTION SHEETS, OVER • 5" CONC SLAB w/ HYDRONIC RADIANT TUBE HEATING SYSTEM PER MECH ON GRADE REINF PER STRUCT, C.J.'S PER STRUCT, OVER • 15 MIL VAPOR BARRIER, ON 2" R-10 RIGID INSULATION • 4" LAYER OF CLEAN-GRADED GRAVEL, OVER • SUBGRADE PREP PER RECOMMENDATIONS OF GEOTECHNICAL REPORT • FILL ALL JOINTS IN SLAB WITH SEALANT F4 SLAB ON GRADE ASSEMBLY: COPYRIGHT: 5/25/2021 11:09:41 AM • 4" CONC SLAB ON GRADE REINF PER STRUCT, C.J.'S PER STRUCT, OVER THESE DRAWINGS ARE THE PROPERTY OF FORGE+BOW DWELLINGS. YOU HEREBY WELDED WIRE AGREE AND UNDERTAKE YOU WILL NOT IN ANYWAY UTILIZE, COPY, REPRODUCE • 2" R-10 RIGID INSULATION OR TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THE DRAWINGS (OR ANY PART OF THEM) PRIOR TO WRITTEN CONSENT BY FORGE+BOW. ALL RIGHTS RESERVED. • 4" LAYER OF CLEAN-GRADED GRAVEL, OVER SUBGRADE PREP PER RECOMMENDATIONS OF GEOTECHNICAL REPORT VAPOR BARRIER • FILL ALL JOINTS IN SLAB WITH SEALANT F5 FLATWORK ASSEMBLY: • 4" EXT. CONCRETE SLAB ON GRADE REINF. W/ FIBERMESH, SUBGRADE PREP PER **RECOMMENDATIONS OF GEOTECHNICAL REPORT** F6 DECK ASSEMBLY: **INDEX SHEET** 2x6 D.FIR T&G WOOD DECK, ON SOLID WOOD DECK JOISTS PER STRUCT CEILINGS C1 GYPSUM BOARD ASSEMBLY: • GYPSUM BOARD (5/8" @ B.O. ROOFS, 1/2" @ B.O. FLOORS) • USE EPOXY PAINT ON CEILINGS IN SHOWERS, ON DRAWING NUMBER: WOOD FRAMING PER PLAN **SOFFITS** A0.0 S1 VENTED PANEL ASSEMBLY: • 4' x 8' TREATED ENGINEERED WD STRAND SUBSTRATE VENTED SOFFIT PANELS • 10 SQ IN OF VENTILATION PER LINEAR FT

(VENTED SOFFIT PANELS @ EDGES OF ROOFS OVER INSULATED SPACES)

Date

2 REAR ELEVATION







2 RIGHT ELEVATION



LEFT ELEVATION SCALE: 1/4" = 1'-0"







ARCHITECTURAL SITE PLAN

IMPROVEMENT SURVEY PLAT

821 WHEDBEE STREET LOT 3, BLOCK 158, FORT COLLINS SITUATE IN THE NORTHWEST QUARTER OF SECTION 13, TOWNSHIP 7 NORTH, RANGE 69 WEST OF THE 6TH P.M.



TRUE NORTH

DESCALE: 1/4" = 1'-0"





















1 MAIN LEVEL DEMO



(2) A5.1

















