

Historic Preservation Services

Community Development & Neighborhood Services 281 North College Avenue P.O. Box 580 Fort Collins, CO 80522.0580

970.416.4250 preservation@fcgov.com fcgov.com/historicpreservation

REPORT OF ALTERATIONS TO DESIGNATED RESOURCE Site Number/Address: 511 Whedbee Street Laurel School National Register Historic District ISSUED: September 30, 2021

Joshua & Alaina Belanger 511 Whedbee Street Fort Collins, CO 80524

Dear Property Owners:

This report is to document proposed alterations to the McKibben House at 511 Whedbee Street, pursuant to Fort Collins Municipal Code Chapter 14, <u>Article IV</u>. A copy of this report may be forwarded to the Colorado Office of Archaeology and Historic Preservation.

The alterations include:

- Construction of a 432 ft2 addition onto the rear of the main house
- Construction of a 304 ft2 carport addition onto the south side of the main house

Our staff review of the proposed work finds the alterations do not meet the <u>SOI Standards for</u> <u>Treatment of Historic Properties</u>. A summary is provided below:

Applicable Code Standard	ode			
SOI #1	A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships;	Y		
	The property will remain in residential use			
SOI #2	The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.	N		
	The McKibben House was built in 1903 by Charles McKibben. McKibben was a local brickmaker who lived next door at 515 Whedbee in 1902 but soon after moved away. It appears as if he was the <i>builder</i> of the home, not its first occupant as the historic district nomination suggested. The 1904 city directory shows D.E. Hutchinson, a painter and paper hanger, as the home's first			

occupant in 1904. However, shortly thereafter, Georgia A. McKibben, a widow, is listed as residing at the property, suggesting Hutchinson was a renter. Character-defining features of the property include its small, Queen Anne/Edwardian design, hipped gable-ell roof form, brick exterior walls, wood windows, and a wood frame porch in the gable ell with simple Doric columns.

Historic survey image of the property from 1994:



Addition – The addition at the rear of the house appears to meet this Standard. While it will result in the removal of a small rear mud porch addition, this alteration does not appear to be a character-defining feature. The location of the addition at the rear of the property will not disrupt the overall character of the property.

Carport – This modification does not meet this Standard. While porte cochere's were seen during the historic district's period of significance (c.1880-1940), they were highly uncommon in Fort Collins, even on residences for wealthier residents, because alley side garages and carriage houses were much more common ways to store wagons, carriages, and vehicles. The highly visible addition of a carport to the home's south elevation will disrupt the overall character of the property. It is not resulting in the removal of any historic features but will be highly noticeable and disrupt the simple design of the property as viewed from Whedbee Street.

SOI #3	Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.	Ν		
	Addition – The master bedroom addition appears to be distinguishable as new construction, using wood siding, and modern, simplified window and door patterns to distinguish it from the historic section of the building.			
	Carport – The carport not only adds a feature that is anachronistic for a home with this historic and architectural context, but creates a false sense of history by matching the front porch's Doric-style Classical columns. While it is recommended to remove the carport from the project plan altogether, if it is to be installed, simple squared columns would reduce the negative effect by keeping the carport clearly distinguishable as a new feature.			
SOI #4	Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved. Like many buildings in the Laurel School Historic District, there have been several exterior modifications made to the property			
	over time:			
	 1903 – main house constructed 1925 – frame 12'x18' garage with wood shingles, drop- board siding built 1926 – rear porch remodeled, framed to 10'x6' 1945 – reshingled house 2009 – reroof 			
	The addition of the master bedroom section will be removing a mud porch addition that was likely the porch the remodeled porch referred to in 1926. While this modification did occur during the historic district's period of significance, the porch appears to have been further altered with a window replacement and new siding, and is not a character-defining feature of the property. Its removal will not violate this Standard.			
SOI #5	Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.	Y		
	While the carport is disrupting the historic design of the property, it does not appear that any distinctive features are being <i>removed</i> as a part of this project.			

SOI #6	Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence. Project plans do not indicate that any historic features on the main house will be removed.	N/A
SOI #7	Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used. No treatments of the historic materials appears to be proposed. Please advise Preservation staff of any treatments proposed to the historic front porch, windows, doors, or brick walls.	N/A
SOI #8	 Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken. A basement is not proposed as part of the addition. Excavation is expected to be limited to the foundation and crawlspace for the addition. Based on the historic context of the property and disturbed nature of the soil in this environment, discovery of diagnostic artifacts in this location is unlikely. Should discovery of archaeological features occur during excavation, please contact Preservation staff immediately. 	Y
SOI #9	 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment. Addition – The bedroom addition appears to meet this Standard and the four factors of compatibility, distinguishability, reversibility (see Standard 10), and subordination. Compatibility – the bedroom addition is attached to the rear of the historic building, uses a similar hipped roof configuration, and uses compatible wood siding which was common siding choice in the historic period for additions. Distinguishability – the bedroom addition differentiates itself from the historic building through the use of wood siding, and simplified modern doors and windows. Subordination – The addition has a lower roof crest height than the historic building, is located at the rear, and has limited visibility from Whedbee Street. 	Ν

	 Carport – The carport addition onto the south elevation does not meet this Standard. Compatibility – the carport addition is not compatible with the overall design of the property. Carport/porte cochere features were almost never installed on homes of this size and type, and especially not in Fort Collins. Distinguishability – the carport addition further is not properly distinguishable as a new feature, creating a false sense of historical development through the use of Classical columns to support the feature. Subordination – In a residential context, side additions of any kind are generally discouraged under the Standards. In this case, the carport will extend to the front wall plane of the property and will be highly visible from Whedbee Street – it does not meet this Standard. 	
SOI #10	New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.	Y
	Addition - The addition is being attached to the main house via the rear porch entry, limiting the modifications and damage to historic materials. As a result, the addition meets this Standard.	
	Carport – The carport addition meets this Standard, being attached using anchor bolts into the masonry. It is strongly encouraged that anchor bolts be driven into the mortar joints and not the brick facings to avoid long-term damage via water infiltration into the masonry wall.	

While the overall project does not meet the Standards, staff feels the property will retain enough character-defining features to remain a contributing property to the Laurel School Historic District and eligible for <u>financial incentives</u> after the project is complete.

If you have any questions regarding this review, please contact me. I may be reached at <u>jbertolini@fcgov.com</u> or at 970-416-4250.

Sincerely,

Jim Bertolini Historic Preservation Planner

Materials and Symb	ols	20 	Abb AB.	reviations Anchor Bolt	. Jì.	Joint				
	•		Alum.	Aluminum	Jst.	Joist		1		
Stud Walls	Insulated Stud Wall	CYTELE	Bm.	Beam	հե	Live Load *			,	
		-h	B.M.	Bench Mark				* 0	Y-	•••
oncrete (Plan)	C.M.U. (Section)		Bott.	Bottom .	· Mecl Mil.					
••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••	narrande de la constante de la		Brg. B.S.	Bearing Both Sides	мп. M.D.	Metal Masonry Opening				T T
.M.U. (Plan)	ZZ. Earth		Bd.	Board	Mer					
					Mat.	Material				annen an
		t	Cabt.	Cabinet						
Brick	Rigid Insulation		Clg.	Ceiling	N.I.(4		
•			сь. С.М.Ц.	Conterline	N.T.	5. Not To Scale		1		
band / Gravel	Wood Frmg.		Conc.	Concrete Masonry Unit Concrete	0.C.	On Center	L			
نىنىنىنە بەر سىنىنىنىيە		·+	Cont.	Continuous	0.D.	Outside Diameter				¥
1		XXXXXXXX	Col.	Column		· · · Opening			P	6
Nood Blocking	Insulation	<u>exercication</u>	C.T.	Ceramic Tile	0pg. 0.5.	Outside		50.00	r a	
• • •		++++++++				4		0	4	
lywood	Finish Wood		Dbl. Dim.	Doub le Dimension	Pl. L	Plate am. Plastic Laminate	1			
•			Dia.	Diameter	PI, L Plym					
oteel (section)	Crypsum Board	1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.	D.L	Dead Load	Pr.	Pair	i i	ω 🖡	r	
· · · · ·		•	Drwg.	Drawing			Se	2	. [T
section Cut		FINS PLR	DHL.	Detail	Q.T.	Quarry Tile	1	8		
A2	Elevation Marker	+ KINS. 14.R.	Dwl.	Dowel			たして			
		\sim	Ea.	Each	Rein RE:	Reinforce . Reference	-1	8 +	5	
Soom Number 123	Door Number	S	Elect.	Electrical	Fev.	Revised, Revision	ব			
•	4 <u>(</u> 1)	\bigcirc	El.	Elevation	Rm.	Room		8		
nterior Elevation	> Window Designation	a	Ex.	Existing	R.O.	Rough Opening	1	S.		_
	A Window Designation		Exp.	Expansion				•,		1
· · · · ·			Ext.	Exterior	Shtg	Sheating)
revision Indicator			F.D.	Floor Drain	Sim.	Similar Specification		an order to	. 1	,
\sim	states and the second		F.D. Fd.	Foundation	50FC	Stainless Steel		+	•	
			Fin. Fir.	Finish Floor	Sid.	Standard		5	A	
			Ftg.	Footing	SH.	Steel		TSET	BANK	
					Strg	Storage		1		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	*		GA	Gauge	Stru	t. Structural				
			6.B. 6.C.	General Contractor	T&B	Top and Bottom				· •
			Cale	CHENERAL CONTRACTOR	180		•	N		

Glass, Glazi Grade

Hardboard Hardwood Hollow Metal

HDWD.

Tongue and Groove Telephone Top Of Typical

Vinyl Asbestos Tils Vinyl Composition Tile

T&G Tele. T.O. TYP.

V.A.T. V.C.T.



Demolition Notes 1. Contractor to verify all items to be Removed, Salvaged, Relocated or Destroyed prior to the start of Demolition work. Coordinate all Demolition work with new work to be done and utility

locations. 2. Remove items, i.e., equipment, appliances, cabinets, backsplashes, finishes, etc., shown as heavy 'dashed lines' on the Demolition Plan. Should there be any question as to what is to be removed, the Architect and/or Owner shall be contacted prior to the demolition or removal.

- 3. Remove existing windows as shown.
- 4. Remove existing doors as indicated. 5. Remove existing wood-framed walls to allow for the new addition as shown.
- 6. Remove Existing concrete steps, walk and drive-paths to existing garage structure to allow for new addition.
- 7. Remove back entry roof system to allow for the new addition as shown.
- 8. Remove and relocate existing electrical as necessary to allow for the new layout as shown.
- 9. Remove portion of existing patio system as required.
- 10. Remove existing cleanout system to allow for new addition as shown and relocate as required. 11. Reasonable care shall be taken to protect the Demolition Site and those in and around it from harm.

12. Due to the nature of Remodeling and Additions, precautions have been taken through the Design process and the Construction Documents phase. However, all work shall be performed in accordance with the actual conditions encountered in the field and the latest editions of the International Residential codes, International Mechanical and Plumbing Codes, I.M.C. and I.P.C., the Electrical codes and Fire Codes, and any local amendments used by the local inspection jurisdiction and local ordinances.



- construction. 3. Contractor shall coordinate any work proposed to be done by the owners, with
- their schedule and/or materials to be used. 4. The contractor shall verify all pre-existing conditions as they relate to the scope of work involved in the construction documents and general notes.
- 5. The dimensions are to the face of studs unless otherwise noted.
- 6. All interior and exterior details shall match existing unless otherwise detailed or noted.
- 7. New exterior walls shall be 2x6 studs @ 16" o.c., unless otherwise noted. New Interior walls shall be 2x4 studs @ 16" o.c., unless otherwise noted. Interior finish is to be smooth finish, painted gypsum board. Baseboard to match other Interior baseboard, both in material, profile and finish.
- 8. Roofing shall match existing in weight, style and color, or as otherwise noted to meet local ordinances.
- 9. Siding, trim etc., shall be as indicated on the drawings. 10. Windows are indicated as generic in size; however, they shall match existing windows in style. Windows shall be Vinyl and color as selected by owner from
- manufacturers' samples. Acceptable manufacturers are Amsco or Gerkin. 11. Finish material, i.e., floor finishes, ceramic floor tiles, hardwoods, cabinets, paint, stains, etc. shall be as selected by the owner from contractor supplied
- samples or by allowances established by contractor. 12. The electrical system shall be examined by the respective contractor as far as existing service adequacy and added to if necessary. Fixtures to be as selected by owner. Electrical is shown diagrammatically.
- 13. Heating system shall be designed and installed by the selected HVAC contractor. At this point, a Mini-Split system is the method of choice for the new addition.

14. Due to the nature of remodeling and additions, precautions have been taken during the Design process and the construction documents phase; however all work shall be accomplished in accordance with the actual conditions encountered in the field and the latest edition of the International Residential Codes, 2018, and all local amendments which are being used by the local jurisdiction and any other local and state ordinances.

work has been approved for a 30" encroachment into the five-Foot side yard setback by the Zoning Board of Appeals during their 08 August 2021 meeting.

Sheet Index

Architectural Sheets

- A-1 Site Plan, Demo. Partial Floor Plan, Roof Plan, Legal Description, Abbreviations, Legends, General Notes, Permit Information
- A-2 Main Floor Plan & Notes, Crawl Space Plan, Foundation Plan, Details and Notes

A-3 Building Elevations

A-4 Building Sections, Framing Plans and Notes, Details



Allen D. Curtis

<u>Archltect</u>

· · · ·	
Drawn By: Alac	Sheet:
Checked By: AC	
Date: 14 AUG. 202	<u>A-1</u>





















