

# **Historic Preservation Services**

Community Development & Neighborhood Services 281 North College Avenue P.O. Box 580 Fort Collins, CO 80522.0580

970.416.4250 preservation@fcgov.com fcgov.com/historicpreservation

# CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS - DENIAL DENIED: December 18, 2020 APPEAL DEADLINE: December 29, 2020

Tara Berglund-Gaffney 126 S. Whitcomb Street Fort Collins, CO 80521

Dear Ms. Berglund-Gaffney:

This letter provides you with confirmation that the proposed changes to your property at 126 S. Whitcomb Street, a contributing property in the Whitcomb Street Landmark District, have been denied by the City's Landmark Preservation Commission (LPC) because the proposed work does not meet the criteria and standards in Chapter 14, <u>Article IV</u> of the Fort Collins Municipal Code.

- 1) Demolition of the historic 1932 one-bay garage northeast of the main house.
- 2) Construction of a new 1.5 story garage northeast of the main house.

The decision to deny was made by a motion of the majority of commissioners at the December 16, 2020 meeting, based on the finding that the proposed project did not meet Rehabilitation Standards 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 9, and 10. The Commission's decision has been made based on the analysis contained in the table below.

Property owners can appeal LPC design review decisions by filing a written notice of appeal to the City Clerk's office within fourteen (14) days of this decision. If you have any questions regarding this denial, please contact Historic Preservation Services staff at preservation@fcgov.com or 970-416-4250.

Sincerely,

Meg Dunn Chair, Landmark Preservation Commission

Applicable Code Standard	Summary of Code Requirement and Analysis (Rehabilitation)	Standard Met (Y/N)
SOI #1	<ul> <li>A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships;</li> <li>The property would remain in residential use without substantial modifications to the primary historic residence.</li> </ul>	Y
SOI #2	The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.	N
	The Whitcomb Street Landmark District was designated in 2013 under Standards 1, 2, and 3 as an important concentration of late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century residential development in Fort Collins. The District's resources span the period from 1889 and 1940, including the Cunningham property at 126 S. Whitcomb constructed in c.1904 with the garage added in 1932. While not the primary resource on most historic properties, the addition of automobile garages to middle-class dwellings in the 1910s-1930s reflects the dramatic cultural and commercial shift from a primarily horse- and rail-driven transportation infrastructure to an automobile one over the first quarter of the twentieth century. This importance was reinforced in the findings of the December 2, 2020 report on secondary features in the district.	
	Garages, especially when constructed during an historic district's period of historical recognition, are considered significant alterations in their own right and help define the overall historic character of the property. They usually should be preserved and in this case, demolition does not meet this Standard.	
SOI #3	Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.	N
	The proposed new garage would create a false sense of history by replicating too much of the historic style of the main house, and not conveying the historic evolution of the property. Specifically, the existing garage was a significant historic alteration added in 1932 during the Great Depression, and as such as simple in design and materials – it was not designed to match the house.	

SOI #4	<ul> <li>Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.</li> <li>As noted under Standard 2, the garage, constructed in 1932, is an historic alteration in its own right and should be preserved.</li> <li>Its proposed demolition does not meet this Standard.</li> </ul>	N
SOI #5	Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved. As noted under Standard 2, the 1932 garage is a distinctive, if less articulate, feature of the site and should be preserved to meet this Standard.	N
SOI #6	Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence. As evidenced by the engineer's report for this garage dated May 27, 2020, using Design Assistance Program funds, the garage does have some structural weaknesses. However, that report identified simple stabilization, correction, and reinforcement techniques that could keep the garage standing and facilitate an addition onto its rear to expand storage/work space. The proposed demolition and replacement garage does not meet this Standard.	N
SOI #7	Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.	N/A
SOI #8	<ul> <li>Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.</li> <li>The expected depth of excavation to clear and replace the existing concrete slab is not to a depth to reach undisturbed soils</li> </ul>	N/A
	that may contain significant archaeological information.	

SOI #9	New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.	N
	The proposed new garage construction requires the demolition of the 1932 garage which is, as noted previously, a distinctive feature of the property. Because of that project element, it does not meet this Standard.	
	The new proposed garage, though compatible, does not appear to be sufficiently distinguishable from the historic residence to meet this Standard.	
SOI #10	New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.	N
	As noted under Standard 9, because this project proposes the demolition/deconstruction of the historic 1932 garage, it does not meet this Standard. But for the demolition of the historic structure, the proposed new garage would be completely separate from the primary historic residence and would not affect the primary resource's historic integrity.	

Tara Gaffney 126 South Whitcomb Street Fort Collins, CO 80521

Paul Sizemore, CDNS Director 281 North College Avenue Fort Collins, CO 80521

8/26/2020

Dear Director Sizemore,

I am writing to appeal the denial, by the staff at the CDNS, of the project to remove the existing garage and to build a new garage on my property at 126 South Whitcomb Street. It is important for my family and for me to move forward with the project because of the need to add a safe, secure and aesthetically pleasing space for property storage, as well as for home office/home schooling. Please allow special permission for this project due to the following unique circumstances:

- The property does not have alley access. Therefore, the space on which to build a new garage is diminished compared to other properties in the neighborhood and on this block of Whitcomb Street. The only accessible garage space is where the current garage is located.
- There is a ditch that runs along the back of the property, further reducing the space to build a new garage.
- The pandemic has created a situation where we are now in need of more indoor space in order to accomplish the following responsibilities: working from home, home-schooling and exercising at home.
- This plan to build a small office/school space above a garage is a financially feasible solution for our family. The alternative option to build an addition to the house would be financially out of reach for us.

Thank you for your time and consideration of the unique circumstances listed above in your decision to allow this project to proceed. It is greatly appreciated.

Sincerely,

Jagmeisn

Tara Gaffney-Berglund



# **Historic Preservation Services**

Community Development & Neighborhood Services 281 North College Avenue P.O. Box 580 Fort Collins, CO 80522.0580

970.416.4250 preservation@fcgov.com fcgov.com/historicpreservation

# CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS - DENIAL DENIED: August 25, 2020 APPEAL DEADLINE: September 8, 2020 (due to holiday on 9/7)

Tara Berglund-Gaffney 126 S. Whitcomb Street Fort Collins, CO 80521

Dear Ms. Berglund-Gaffney:

This letter provides you with confirmation that the proposed changes to your property at 126 S. Whitcomb Street, a contributing property in the Whitcomb Street Landmark District, have been denied by the City's Historic Preservation Division because the proposed work does not meet the criteria and standards in Chapter 14, <u>Article IV</u> of the Fort Collins Municipal Code.

- 1) Demolition of the historic 1932 one-bay garage northeast of the main house.
- 2) Construction of a new 1.5 story garage northeast of the main house.

The decision has been made based on the analysis contained in the table below. Property owners can appeal staff design review decisions by filing a written notice of appeal to the Director of Community Development & Neighborhood Services within fourteen (14) days of this decision. If you have any questions regarding this denial, or if I may be of any assistance, please do not hesitate to contact me. I may be reached at <u>jbertolini@fcgov.com</u>, or 970-416-4250.

Sincerely,

Jim Bertolini Historic Preservation Planner

Applicable Code Standard	Summary of Code Requirement and Analysis (Rehabilitation)	Standard Met (Y/N)
SOI #1	A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships;	Y
	The property would remain in residential use without substantial modifications to the primary historic residence.	

SOI #2	The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.	N
	The Whitcomb Street Landmark District was designated in 2013 under Standards 1, 2, and 3 as an important concentration of late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century residential development in Fort Collins. The District's resources span the period from 1889 and 1940, including the Cunningham property at 126 S. Whitcomb constructed in c.1904 with the garage added in 1932. While not the primary resource on most historic properties, the addition of automobile garages to middle-class dwellings in the 1910s-1930s reflects the dramatic cultural and commercial shift from a primarily horse- and rail-driven transportation infrastructure to an automobile one over the first quarter of the twentieth century.	
	Garages, especially when constructed during an historic district's period of historical recognition, are considered significant alterations in their own right and help define the overall historic character of the property. They usually should be preserved and in this case, demolition does not meet this Standard.	
SOI #3	Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.	Y
	All proposed alterations would be clearly distinguishable as new. The proposed new garage includes modern window and door treatments and a slab foundation that avoid any false sense of history if it were to be constructed.	
SOI #4	<ul> <li>Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.</li> <li>As noted under Standard 2, the garage, constructed in 1932, is an historic alteration in its own right and should be preserved.</li> </ul>	N
SOI #5	Its proposed demolition does not meet this Standard.Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniquesor examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will bepreserved.	N
	As noted under Standard 2, the 1932 garage is a distinctive, if less articulate, feature of the site and should be preserved to meet this Standard.	

SOI #6	Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.	N
	As evidenced by the engineer's report for this garage dated May 27, 2020, using Design Assistance Program funds, the garage does have some structural weaknesses. However, that report identified simple stabilization, correction, and reinforcement techniques that could keep the garage standing and facilitate an addition onto its rear to expand storage/work space. The proposed demolition and replacement garage does not meet this Standard.	
SOI #7	Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.	N/A
SOI #8	<ul> <li>Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.</li> <li>The expected depth of excavation to clear and replace the existing concrete slab is not to a depth to reach undisturbed soils that may contain significant archaeological information.</li> </ul>	N/A
SOI #9	New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment. The proposed new garage construction requires the demolition of the 1932 garage which is, as noted previously, a distinctive feature of the property. Because of that project element, it does not meet this Standard.	N
	But for the demolition of the historic garage, the new proposed garage does appear to be sufficiently compatible with, distinguishable from, and subordinate to, the historic residence. It uses similar cladding materials to the original house (shingles and lapboard), and is lower than the historic house, being secondary in massing and scale, establishing compatibility. It utilizes modern window and door treatments to help distinguish it as new construction. But for the demolition of the historic garage, the new garage would meet this Standard.	

SOI #10	New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.	N
	As noted under Standard 9, because this project proposes the demolition/deconstruction of the historic 1932 garage, it does not meet this Standard. But for the demolition of the historic structure, the proposed new garage would be completely separate from the primary historic residence and would not affect the primary resource's historic integrity.	



# Design Review Application Historic Preservation Division

Fill this form out for all applications regarding designated historic buildings within the city limits of the City of Fort Collins. Review is required for these properties under Chapter 14, <u>Article IV</u> of the Fort Collins Municipal Code.

#### **Applicant Information**

Tara Gaffney	970-215-3691	970-215-3691
Applicant's Name	Daytime Phone	Evening Phone
126 S Whitcomb St, Fort Collins		CO 80521
Mailing Address (for receiving application-related correspondence)		State Zip Code
tara_berglund@yahoo.com		
Email		
Property Information (put N/A if owner is applicant)		
N/A		
Owner's Name	Daytime Phone	Evening Phone
Mailing Address (for receiving application-related correspondence)		State Zip Code
Enail		

#### Email

#### **Project Description**

Provide an overview of your project. Summarize work elements, schedule of completion, and other information as necessary to explain your project.

Deconstruct and/or demolish the current garage in order to build a functional, safe, secure and accessible single-car garage of one and one-half stories including habitable space on the upper level. The new garage, scheduled to be complete by the end of 2020, will be built in the same general area on the property as is the existing garage, abiding by all set-back equirements. The property does not allow for

alley access and therefore, the location is limited to replacing the existing garage in the current location. The new garage will be designed

to duplicate details of the house in order to preserve and enhance the design of the historic property and the block of South Whitcomb Street.

**Reminders:** 

and proposed.

Complete application would need all of checklist items as well as both

Detailed scope of work should include measurements of existing

pages of this document.

The following attachments are REQUIRED:

Complete Application for Design Review

Detailed Scope of Work (and project plans, if available)

Color photos of existing conditions

Please note: if the proposal includes partial or full demolition of an existing building or structure, a separate demolition application will need to be approved.

Additional documentation may be required to adequately depict the project, such as plans, elevations, window study, or mortar analysis. If there is insufficient documentation on the property, the applicant may be required to submit an intensive-level survey form (at the applicant's expense).

# Detail of Proposed Rehabilitation Work (\*Required)

If your project includes multiple features (e.g. roof repair and foundation repair), you must describe each feature separately and provide photographs and other information on each feature.

Feature A Name:	
Describe property feature and its condition:	Describe proposed work on feature:
Remove Existing Garage	Remove the existing garage, which is unsafely leaning to the south, by way of deconstruction or demolition. Construction materials may be donated, if practical and feasible, in order to prevent them from going to the landfill.
	Please give special consideration to the fact that the property does not allow for alley access. This prevents preservation of the existing garage in order to accomplish the overall goal of constructing a new, secure and safe garage with space for office or schooling. The property contains a ditch along the back of the lot, which increases set-back requirements and also limits the location of a garage to the current location.
Feature B Name:	
Describe property feature and its condition:	Describe proposed work on feature:
Construct a New Garage of One and One-Half Stories with Habitable Space	Construct a new garage on the property in the same general location as the existing garage. The new garage will be designed to preserve and enhance the historical design of the 1890's home. Design features on the garage that will be identical to the house include: roof pitch, trim details, window size, wood shingles and bead-board soffit. The garage will be one and one-half stories to match the house, including habitable space on the upper floor. The design will strictly follow the Neighborhood Conservation - Medium Density District guidelines and all set-back requirements.
Line Additional Workshoots on pos	Please give special consideration to the fact that this garage will provide a more secure and safe building for property storage, as well as a functional space for home office and/or home schooling - which has become necessary in this time of the pandemic. Constructing a detached garage with habitable space is the most financially attainable option for our family in order to achieve this goal.

Use Additional Worksheets as needed.

### **Required Additional information**

The following items must be submitted with this completed application. Digital submittals preferred for photographs, and for other items where possible.

- At least one current photo for each side of the house. Photo files or prints shall be named/labeled with applicant name and elevation. For example, smitheast.jpg, smithwest.jpg, etc. If submitted as prints, photos shall be labeled
- Photos for each feature as described in the section "Detail of Proposed Rehabilitation Work". Photo files or prints shall be named or labeled with applicant name and feature letter. For example, smitha1.jpg, smitha2.jpg, smithb.jpg, smithc.jpg, etc.

Depending on the nature of the project, one or more of the following items shall be submitted. Your contractor should provide these items to you for attachment to this loan application.

- Drawing with dimensions.
- Product specification sheet(s).
- Description of materials included in the proposed work.
- Color sample(s) or chip(s) of all proposed paint colors.

**Partial or full demolition** is a part of this project.

Partial demolition could include scopes such as taking off existing rear porches to create space for a new addition or removing an existing wall or demolishing a roof. If you are taking away pieces of the existing residence, you are likely undergoing some partial demolition.

Signature of Applicant

8/19/2020

Date









S A	VAN T
DATE	
BY	
NO. DESCRIPTION	
SHEET TITLE:	126 South Whitcomb St. Fort Collins, CO 80521
PROJECT DESCRIPTION:	Carage
DRAWINGS PROVIDED BY: Savant Homes Inc	
DAT	
8/18 SCA	3/2020
JUF	NTS
SHE	ET:
	1



FRONT SCALE: 1/4" = 1'-0"

- SHAKER SIDING

- 2X2 REDWOOD SPINDLES ON 2X4 RAILS W/ 2X6 CAP.

- METAL GARAGE DOOR





nnnri ╧┻┻







SAVANT
DATE
BY
VO. DESCRIPTION
SHEET TITLE: 126 South Whitcomb St. Fort Collins, CO 80521
PROJECT DESCRIPTION: Garage
DRAWINGS PROVIDED BY: Savant Homes Inc.
DATE:
8/18/2020 SCALE:
NTS
SHEET:
<b>A-2</b>

# - ASPHALT SHINGLES

- 4X4 POST

- 6" SIDING





	5
S A	
DATE	
BΥ	
. DESCRIPTION	
NO.	b St.
SHEET TITLE:	126 South Whitcomb St Fort Collins, CO 80521
PROJECT DESCRIPTION:	garage
DRAWINGS PROVIDED BY:	Savant Homes Inc. , -
DA	TE:
8/1	8/2020
SC	ALE:
SHI	EET:
A	•





S A	VANT MES INC.
DATE	
BΥ	
NO. DESCRIPTION	
SHEET TITLE:	126 South Whitcomb St. Fort Collins, CO 80521
DRAWINGS PROVIDED BY:	Savant Homes Inc.
DA	TE:
	8/2020 ALE:
	TS
SH	EET:











