

PEDCOR Neighborhood Meeting - Lakeview On The Rise
Ashley Estates
6403 Eden Garden Drive
Loveland, CO 80538

3/24/16

Overview

- Low-density mixed-use neighborhood (LMN) zone district
- Planning and Zoning Board is the decision maker
- Multi-family housing is an allowed use in LMN

Applicant Presentation

- Applicant team
 - Patrick Stoffregen - Developer
 - Ryan Rodgers – Developer
 - Bruce Hagen – Engineer
 - Phil Stoffregen – Executive Vice President, Development
 - Amy Moorehead – Property Manager, Ashley Estates
- To view presentation for the next 30 days: Bit.ly/LOTR324
- Developers of workforce housing for more than 25 years
- Vertically integrated company – all functions in one company. Development, management, construction, etc.
- Residential screening criteria, including background check, 3rd party income verification, sex offender list check, no tolerance drug policy, etc.
- Ground-floor units are handicap-accessible or adaptable
- Have developed 2 apt complexes in Colorado – Meadows at Dunker (Aurora) and Ashley Estates (Loveland)
- 3321 inquiries at Ashley Estates for 224 apartments; 3697 inquiries for 204 apartments in Aurora
- Apartment type: workforce multifamily apartments
 - Everyone needs to have an income source
 - Recent college grads, firefighters, nurses, seniors, city employees
 - Workforce housing is in high demand in FC/Loveland
 - Target 60% of Area Median Income
- Estimate that there are 5,783 renter households within a 15 minute drive of the site that are in the target income range, only 1,101 apartments within the same area
- Required to have 312 parking spaces, have 315 in addition to 24 garage spaces. Expanded on-street parking on both sides of the street, estimate 60 spaces there.
- Providing connections to properties on north and east
- 12-unit and 8-unit buildings, varied in color, architectural detail, and materials

Q and A

Clarification (City): Address everyone's Stonybrook question – we try to connect streets when we can. We have a Master Street Plan that shows the location of all the streets. Stonybrook is a collector, which means it's a smaller street, distributing traffic to neighborhoods. Stonybrook is not shown on the Master Street Plan as connecting to College. Still an open question about whether Stonybrook will connect to College. Open to feedback about what you'd like to see, and I think we heard loud and clear tonight that there's some disagreement.

Q (citizen): Hard to get onto Trilby from Debra, City hasn't done anything to address traffic in that whole area. Even further west, at Shields and Trilby there's no left turn. Traffic has never been addressed.

Q: When and where is the appropriate place to address the Stonybrook question?

A (City): This is step 1. My job is to take this feedback to the rest of the City departments.

Q: How do we find out what else we can do?

A (City): Take my card, send me an email, and I'll keep you up to date. I will send out all of the notes from this meeting as soon as I can, and then after that I will get answers to these open questions. We aren't going to be able to answer all of the questions tonight.

Q: There is a property on a cul-de-sac that we own – if it's going to be a major artery, we can't even consider redeveloping it.

Q: Will you bring the picture back up of the site? (Google Earth) I've seen this place, it seems nice, but the pressure of the population if Stonybrook is opened up will hurt our neighborhood (Pelican Ridge). We need a commitment that they're not going to put Stonybrook through. We can't have a collector going into a bunch of residential 25 mph streets. I'm hoping that the people from the City will keep that in mind when they're making the decision. From the skate park we already get a lot of traffic, trash, noise, and putting Stonybrook through will increase these problems even more.

A (Applicant): What we're doing is what the City requires, and we're glad to hear your feedback. It sounds like you have concerns about that, and we want to make sure that feedback is heard. We're concerned about through-traffic as well.

Q: Sounds to me like you're developing an I-25 up to Trilby (Debra, if it connects)

Q: I'm concerned about the traffic. To get in and out of Shenandoah. Serious traffic issue, and if they can't take immediate steps to fix it, this development will aggravate an already serious traffic problem.

A (Applicant): We've had a Traffic Impact Study conducted, and that study found that given the current traffic alone, a right turn lane is warranted on Trilby. We're accountable for the impact we have on that situation. We will be stepping up to do our part to help in that solution.

Q: So you're saying PEDCOR will be contributing financially?

A: Yes, we will be paying our share.

A (City): We haven't gotten a traffic study, so we don't have conclusions yet. It's helpful to hear the feedback so we can incorporate it when we work through the development process. College and Trilby is congested, and we're monitoring it very closely. There are a couple things we use to analyze it. We can't legally require a development to come in and mitigate existing deficiencies. We can only require them to mitigate *their* impact. Along College, the complicating factor is that 287 is under the jurisdiction of the Department of Transportation. We need to work with DOT on that. In the entire region (CDOT Region 4) College and Trilby is getting close to the top of their list. That creates opportunities to get some funding to make improvements. We know the problems exist, we're working on a plan, and we can only hold this development responsible for their impact.

Q: I'm concerned that Pelican Ridge is going to be surrounded by low-income housing. That directly impacts the value of my home and resale. What is the City's view on that, and why are we being surrounded by low-income housing?

Q: And they all go to the same school (Loveland school)

A (City): Most of the low income housing in FC has been located in Downtown and on the North end of the City, and is not just concentrated in one location. When reviewing development proposals, we do not take property values into account. We don't have a way to predict what the housing impact is going to be.

A (Applicant): In our experience over the last 25 years, we've seen that homes next to our developments don't have reduced property values. What does have an impact is a "fly-by-night" management company. We've seen single-family homes come in after our projects are built. We are a better neighbor than a single-family home because we have rules, regulations, leases that allow us to fix problems when they happen. You can't do that with a single-family neighbor that's not a good neighbor.

A (Applicant): You can see from the demand that there are thousands of people who can replace anyone who misbehaves.

Q: One more comment about Trilby – Trilby from College to Lemay is so dangerous to cross. It's a huge problem.

A (City): It's probably from College to Shields as well. What's hard is that a lot of times the improvements come as development comes, but people don't want to see the development until the improvements are made.

Q: What about grocery stores? There's no grocery store anywhere near here.

Q: Is there going to be an entrance/exit right off of College?

A (Applicant): Yes.

Q: Will there be a traffic light?

A (City): The DOT has an Access Control Plan for 287 that identifies what the access will look like along College. In this development they are not signalized, they allow left turns in but not left turns out

Q: I know this is an LMN zone, and there are certain things that have to happen. How large is this site? Developments over 10 acres are supposed to have a community park open to everyone. I know you have your park there, and a pool...just want to make sure it's open to the public. Schools are another issue. Where are these students going to go? We bought in with CARE affordable housing already there, so obviously we don't have an issue living next to affordable housing. What about overall infrastructure? Commercial access, grocery stores, schools, bike trails, etc. I would encourage the City to re-look at access to these things. It feels like our end of town is getting saddled with low-income housing without infrastructure to support our neighborhood.

A (Applicant): The site is 19.995 acres

A (City): We send development proposals to 27 or more departments, including school districts. In this case, that's Loveland. As far as grocery stores and the King Soopers discussion, King Soopers still owns that site. The City's approach to development is that the developer pays its own way. They pay for stormwater improvements, streets, trails, etc. In the case of the King Soopers site, drainage was a big and expensive issue.

A (Applicant): The park will be available to the public. The pool will not. There will be a pelican viewing area for birdwatchers.

Q: This whole section of the City is all Loveland school district

Q: Just want to be clear – while we appreciate Martina's comments, our comments weren't focused to PEDCOR or CDOT, they were focused to the City, which is responsible for Trilby.

A (City): Thank you.

Q: Who is addressing the impacts to wildlife?

A (City): We have very strict buffer standards – 300 foot buffer. Wetlands must be protected, and there is a buffer requirement there too. The applicant had to do an Ecological Characterization Study (ECS), which was done this fall/winter. The new site plan is meeting the buffer requirements.

A (Applicant): Because we did our ECS in the fall, it was difficult to say if there was waterfowl activity. City was amenable to a variable buffer that was 300 feet on average. The tradeoff from buildings within the buffer and buildings further away is an average of 300 feet. We will also do an additional ECS when it's warmer to see the full extent of the wetlands. If the wetlands come back bigger, we'll do more to protect them.

Q: What about cleanup and trash?

A (Applicant): Our maintenance staff will be responsible for cleanup.

Q: Is there another way we can get our comments in about wildlife in particular? This area is very diverse – duck, bald eagle, and lots of other species.

A (City): Take my card and please send me comments.

Q: Who does the study?

A (Applicant): We hire someone.

A (City): Our environmental planners also go out to check the site and review the study.

Q: Potential impact if Debra and Stonybrook go through – you're funneling people who use Trilby onto College through this site. That's a tremendous amount of traffic. Something for the City to look at. It's a lot of traffic going through their site without a light, and is a major safety concern. By being able to force people to use certain roads to get to certain arterials, it helps spread out the problem.

A (City): Those are great comments. The way we're requiring these folks to look at their traffic impact is assuming that all of their traffic goes in and out on College, because as of right now they can't connect to the north or east. But we're requiring them to structure the site so that they *could* connect in the future. As we update the master street plan, we'll need to look at it. Those are conversations we need to have.

Q: What about the dirt road to the north?

A (Applicant): That's not our property.

Q: Would it be impossible to make the road go straight and not curve through the neighborhood? If the roads are going to connect.

A (Applicant): Actually there is an emergency access plan for fire access. If we were to switch the layout of the site, we might not meet the fire and site planning requirements.

Q: Do you own the property now?

A (Applicant): We have it under contract.

Q: A few things: One of the City's criteria is proximity to employment, schools, transportation, retail, and recreation. This site doesn't have any of those. We've got our share of affordable housing in this part of the City. Give it to somebody else. That's burdening our section of town with no amenities for the people who are moving in. How many more cars? At least 2 per unit. Is this by the bedroom or by unit? Will this be another Summit?

A (City): There were no parking requirements when the Summit was built.

A (Applicant): 2 to 1 parking ratio. We average 1.1 persons per bedroom across 16,000 units in the country. We're meeting the City's parking requirements for parking spaces. Our minimum was 312, and

we have 315 + 24 + on-street (approximately 60). We can't count the on-street spots toward the City requirements, but they are there.

Q: The City decided not to work with King Soopers, and they could sell that to anyone. There are no amenities here.

A (Applicant): We believe demand is going to be high here. It's a fair question – there's a chicken-and-egg issue. When no development has gone in, it doesn't look good for retail. If we put in these households, maybe demand for retail will go up.

A (Applicant): What about this development (Ashley Estates)? You could say that about this area, but demand for this development is high. The rents that we're charging here are \$100-\$300 cheaper than market rate apartments, but they're market-rate quality. For a lot of people that's enough.

Q: What incentives do people have to maintain things?

A (Applicant): We take care of our places all across the country. We have full-time, on-site maintenance personnel.

Q: Is this parcel one that was purchased for affordable housing by the city?

A (City): No.

Q: What is workforce housing? 30-60% or 60-100% of Area Median Income (AMI)?

A (Applicant): 60% maximum AMI. Rents: \$780 for a 1 bedroom, \$930 for a 2 bedroom, \$1075 for 3 bedrooms. Income ranges from \$32,700-\$54,000 annual income depending on household size

Q: So there are no market-rate apartments?

A (Applicant): No

Q: What is the timeline for the project and impact to infrastructure?

A (Applicant): Hope to break ground in about 1 year, construction would take 12 months, totally leased within 24 months. Utility impacts – we're in the South Fort Collins Sanitation District – there was a question about capacity, but we have addressed that and have found a solution.

Q: How many units?

A (Applicant): 224

Q: How many residents are under 20 years old?

A (Applicant): We don't have kids in our 1-bedroom apartments. We can get back to you with information about how many school-age children we can expect to see.

Q: This is a great complex, but with one lousy playground. I would think you'd have 2-3 playgrounds around to provide more places for kids to play, both in this development and from the neighborhood.

Q: Has the City thought about expanding Carpenter Road?

A (City): Carpenter is still planned to end at College because of restrictions to the west (community separators and open space). We're about to update our Transportation Master Plan, which lays out the overall plan for the street and transportation network. Currently the Master Street Plan shows Trilby as a 2-lane arterial. Are there classifications that need to change? As we embark on these projects we'll need to look at that.

Q: Why aren't there left turn arrows at Shields and Trilby? It's even worse on Taft Hill.

A (City): Point taken, and great question. Anyone who wants to stay after, I'd be happy to explain when we put in arrows and why – it's not specifically relevant to this development. I know it's frustrating, and there is a reason for it.

Q: Explain to me what the undeveloped space to the north of the site is, and what the potential is.

A (City): Part is owned by the City, purchased by the Land Bank program. That site has expansive soils issues, so we're not sure exactly what to do with it. The other piece of property is privately owned to the north, and not sure what the owner's plans are for that site.

Q: Maybe suitable for a large park?

Q: I want to make a statement that I feel the City of Fort Collins drops the ball on traffic issues in this town. I think the City needs to push the state to expand Carpenter west. There's nothing that takes you west. The other problem – the City is going to be built out soon. How is the City going to pay for roads, etc. if development is supposed to pay for things? I'm for your project, people need housing and its good looking. But the City is not taking care of traffic in this town.

A (City): We collect fees as part of development projects. There's also a fee called the street oversizing fee that goes to expanding arterials. City departments prioritize road projects and capital improvements based on need. As Martina said, one of the most constrained intersections in the City is College and Trilby. I can't say exactly when it will be improved, but it's on the list. And all development (not just this project) pays into it. The other way we fund things is through tax initiatives and ballot issues. It's not a perfect system, but that's the system we have in place. These are comments we need to hear, and I appreciate your feedback.

Q: There's an irrigation ditch in the northeast corner – what are your plans for that?

A (Applicant): As part of the ECS, they mentioned that it needs to be maintained. We will be adjusting the site plan to ensure that we protect the ditch.

Q: The people who head toward Loveland will need to turn around to go south again without a left-out turn.

Q: What about Triangle? You could put a signal there.

A (Applicant): We're open to ideas. Ideally people would be able to turn left, but the City and CDOT have their requirements.

Q: Are you going to be building some sort of fence around the complex?

A (Applicant): If it's required for noise mitigation we will, but our plan is to have heavy landscaping along College.

Q: This is Loveland schools, right? If you can't make a left to get south on College, buses and teenagers driving to school - that's a disaster.

Q: I think most of what we're saying is that the City needs to look at traffic more closely in this area.

A (City): I hear what you're saying. There are a number of different issues we're thinking about. Part of what we gave to the applicant is the Access Control Plan for 287, which includes the no-left turn out. What we need to figure out is whether we allow the left turn out or implement the full Access Control Plan. These are great comments, and we'll take these back to the DOT. We'll work with them on it and with the applicant to try to find a reasonable solution both in the interim and long-term.

Q: Even if the Master Street Plan does include all the connections, it could be 50 years before someone develops that.

A (City): That's why we need to think about this. We want to make sure that we're thinking both about the interim and the long-term potential. We have a long ways to go.

Q: Has the site been looked at for light pollution and night sky protection? I can see the stars from my backyard, and I don't want that to change.

A (City): Yes. All lights have to be cut-off and directed downward. For LED lights, we're recommending warmer color temperatures.

Q: I can't express enough the concern I have about Debra drive being used to access Trilby.

Q: What access would your residents use to get to Waterview Park?

A (Applicant): Sidewalks that connect to Stonybrook. If that connection doesn't come through, I don't know what the answer is. We'd need to look at that.

Q: Could maybe allow pedestrian only access? If Stonybrook doesn't go through.

Q: It seems like this area of town is a stepchild. None of this seems reasonable. We can't get public transportation, these residents are being forced right and can't take a left, the roads don't get widened...

A (Applicant): If CDOT allows $\frac{3}{4}$ access, they will require an acceleration/deceleration lane, with the long-term plan that the lane becomes an extra lane on College.

Q: Why not put in a light rail system before it's too expensive?

A (Applicant): We've partnered before with UHaul car share, and if that's something the City wants or that you want we could look at that.

A (City): Transit requires a certain population density to make it work. For buses, that's about 15 dwelling units/acre. This is coming in well below that, and the surrounding area is even less dense.

Q: How many units/acre?

A (Applicant): Just about 9 dwelling units/acre. We're well below the maximum. And part of the issues we're talking about with schools and infrastructure is included in zoning, so our development should be well within the capacity of the surrounding infrastructure.

Q: How do you keep your rental rates below market and your properties looking beautiful?

A (Applicant): Low-Income Housing Tax Credits are the program we use to keep rental rates below market. We also rely on keeping occupancy rates at 95-97%, and on cost savings from being a vertically integrated company.

Q: What happens when a resident makes too much income?

A (Applicant): They qualify when they initially come in, they can stay if their income goes up. We're not allowed to charge more than the set maximum. We can't exclude or kick them out if their income goes up.

Q: What I'm hearing from everyone is that the City needs to get its priorities straight. Why put in new development when the existing infrastructure is inadequate?

A (City): Point taken.

Q (Applicant): Is there any way that our development coming in will advance the City's goal to improve College and Trilby?

A (City): If there's more development, and more people using the streets, that would seem to indicate that improvement needs to happen sooner. Improvements are expensive, and construction costs have gone up dramatically over the last few years. Contractors are all busy building roads for flood recovery, so costs have gone up. We do look for partner projects with larger developers. We put a lot of requirements on developers, and we get criticized sometimes for that because we charge a lot of fees. Is that enough for all the improvements we need? No. We're always looking for partners to help us make things happen. The short answer is, it depends, but it can't hurt.

Q: Where in the process do the streets and infrastructure get evaluated?

A (City): This development will generate enough traffic that it requires a Traffic Impact Study to help us look at those things. Once we get that study we'll have some numbers to take a look at. The access point they're showing now is not planned for signalization. In general, when we put in a signal safety goes down because it creates rear-end crashes. We evaluate all of these things when the project is formally submitted.

Q: Did the Traffic Impact Study include College only or also Trilby?

A (Applicant): The Traffic Impact Study included College, Trilby, and Carpenter.

Q: At what point do we as citizens have another look at this?

A (City): There are a couple of options. We post all of the submittal documents online at <http://fcgov.com/citydocs>. One neighborhood meeting is required. Another neighborhood meeting could happen, but that is completely up to the Applicant. The next time officially is at the Planning and Zoning Board hearing. If you received a letter for this meeting, you will also receive a letter about that hearing. Please also feel free to contact me anytime and take one of my cards.

Q: What is your timeframe for submitting to the City after this meeting?

A (Applicant): It will be at least a month.