

Table of Contents

PART I - EXECUTIVE SUMMARY: Pg. 1

- 1. NISP Would Cause Significant Impacts to the Water Quality of Horsetooth Reservoir and to the Cache la Poudre River in Fort Collins: Pg. 2**
- 2. The Corps Has Not Fulfilled its Obligation to Analyze and Protect the River and City's Drinking Water Supply: Pg. 3**
- 3. The DEIS Does Not Adequately Analyze the Impacts of NISP on Fort Collins: Pg. 3**
 - 3a. City Drinking Water Sources: Pg. 4**
 - 3b. Water Quality Impacts to the Cache la Poudre River: Pg. 4**
 - 3c. Trichloroethene Contamination: Pg. 5**
 - 3d. Threats to Fish Habitat and Increased Flooding Risks from Sedimentation: Pg. 5**
 - 3e. Impacts to Vegetation and Wetlands Along the River: Pg. 6**
 - 3f. Impacts to Fish and Wildlife: Pg. 7**
 - 3g. Air Quality and Climate: Pg. 7**
 - 3h. Recreation and Quality of Life: Pg. 8**
 - 3i. Socioeconomic Impacts to Fort Collins and Its Residents: Pg. 8**
- 4. A Supplemental DEIS and Revised 404(b)(1) Analysis Are Necessary to Address the DEIS's Shortcomings. Along with Improving the Data and Analysis of Impacts, the SDEIS and Revised 404(b)(1) Analysis Must Contain Definite and Specific Measures Designed to Avoid, Minimize and Mitigate NISP's Significant Degradation of the Aquatic Environment: Pg. 9**

PART II - PROCEDURAL AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR CITY COMMENTS: Pg. 11

- 1. The Corps has an Obligation to Analyze, Avoid, Minimize and Mitigate Impacts Associated with NISP: Pg. 13**
 - 1a. Section 404 of the Clean Water Act: Pg. 13**
 - 1b. Section 401 of the Clean Water Act: Pg. 15**
 - 1c. The National Environmental Policy Act: Pg. 16**
 - 1d. Summary: Pg. 17**
- 2. The Corps Must Evaluate Impacts to City of Fort Collins Drinking Water and the Cache La Poudre River, Including Special Aquatic Sites and**

Other Specially Protected Resources Under the Clean Water Act. The EIS Must Examine Indirect, as Well as Direct Impacts to the Project:

Pg. 17

2a. Legal Requirement To Study Indirect Impacts in the DEIS: Pg. 17

2b. Legal Requirements To Study Impacts on City Natural Areas: Pg. 19

2c. Legal Requirements To Address Impacts To City Water Supplies, Parks and Recreation: Pg. 20

- 3. An Essential Predicate for Avoiding, Minimizing and Mitigating Impacts is Proper Identification and Analysis of Impacts, Which the DEIS Fails to Provide; the Corps Must Provide a Scientifically Rigorous Analysis: Pg. 21**

- 4. The DEIS Fails To Satisfy the Obligation to Avoid, Minimize and Mitigate Impacts: Pg. 22**
 - 4a. The DEIS's "Commitments" Regarding Total Organic Carbon Do Not Comply with the Clean Water Act: Pg. 23**
 - 4b. The DEIS Fails to Meaningfully Address Impacts Associated With Lost Peak Flows: Pg. 26**
 - 4c. Section 101(g) of the Clean Water Act Does Not Diminish The Corps' Obligations under Section 404: Pg. 28**

- 5. The DEIS's Use of Adaptive Management Is Inappropriate and Inadequate: Pg. 30**

- 6. Because of the DEIS's Failure To Provide Sufficient Analysis of the Impacts of the Proposed Permit and Address Their Avoidance, Minimization and Mitigation, A Supplemental Environmental Impact Statement Is Necessary To Comply With NEPA and the Clean Water Act: Pg. 34**

- 7. The Corps May Not Segment or Defer its Analysis of the Impacts of the Glade-Horsetooth Pipeline: Pg. 37**

PART III - WATER MANAGEMENT ISSUES: Pg. 39

- 1. Source Water and Drinking Water Treatment: Pg.40**
 - 1a. Comments on DEIS: Pg. 40**
 - 1b. Comments on Supplemental Information: Pg. 54**
 - 1c. Summary of TOC-Related Impacts to Fort Collins Drinking Water Quality: Pg. 52**

- 2. Water Quality Impacts on the Cache la Poudre River Due to Deliveries From the NISP Project: Pg. 59**
 - 2a. Comments on DEIS: Pg. 59**
 - 2b. Comments on Water Quality Technical Report (WQTR): Pg. 66**

- 2c. **Summary of Regulatory Impacts to Poudre River Water Quality:**
Pg. 75
- 3. **Trichloroethylene (TCE):** Pg. 78
- 4. **NISP Operations:** Pg. 83
 - 4a. **Comments on DEIS:** Pg. 83
 - 4b. **Comments on Water Resources Technical Report (WRTR):** Pg. 85
- 5. **Cumulative Impacts:** Pg. 86
 - 5a. **Comments on DEIS:** Pg. 86
 - 5b. **Comments on Water Resources Technical Report (WRTR):** Pg. 87
- 6. **References for Part III:** Pg. 88

PART IV - Environmental Impacts: Pg. 91

- 1. **Natural Resource General Comments:** Pg. 92
- 2. **River Morphology:** Pg. 95
 - 2a. **General Comments:** Pg. 95
 - 2b. **Specific Comments on DEIS:** Pg. 97
 - 2c. **Comments on River Morphology and Sediment Transport Technical Report (RMSTTR):** Pg. 114
- 3. **Riparian Vegetation and Wetlands:** Pg. 118
 - 3a. **General Comments:** Pg. 118
 - 3b. **Specific Comments on DEIS:** Pg. 120
 - 3c. **Comments on Vegetation Technical Report (VTR):** Pg. 126
- 4. **Aquatic Habitat Quality and Aquatic Life:** Pg. 138
 - 4a. **General Comments:** Pg. 138
 - 4b. **Specific Comments on DEIS:** Pg. 138
 - 4c. **Comments on Aquatic Biological Resource Technical Report (ABRTR):** Pg. 143
- 5. **Terrestrial Wildlife:** Pg. 147
 - 5a. **General Comments:** Pg. 147
 - 5b. **Specific Comments on DEIS:** Pg. 149
 - 5c. **Comments on Wildlife Technical Report (WTR):** Pg. 156
- 6. **Air Quality and Climate Change:** Pg. 163
 - 6a. **General Comments:** Pg. 163
 - 6b. **Specific Comments on DEIS:** Pg. 167
- 7. **Procedural Issues:** Pg. 170

8. **References for Part IV:** Pg. 173

Part V - Recreation, Aesthetics, Socioeconomics & Cumulative Effects:
Pg. 185

1. **General Comments:** Pg. 186
 - 1a. **Impact of the Proposed Action to Fort Collins' Economy:** Pg. 188
 - 1b. **Impact of the Proposed Action on Recreation:** Pg. 192
 - 1c. **Concluding General Comments:** Pg. 194
2. **Recreation:** Pg. 194
 - 2a. **General Comments:** Pg. 187
 - 2b. **Specific Comments on DEIS:** Pg. 195
 - 2c. **Comments on Recreation Resource Technical Report (RRTR):** Pg. 199
3. **Socioeconomics & Aesthetics:** Pg. 201
 - 3a. **General Comments:** Pg. 201
 - 3b. **Specific Comments on DEIS - Aesthetics & Visual Resources:** Pg. 201
 - 3c. **Comments on Visual Resources Comprehensive Technical Report (VRCTR):** Pg. 202
 - 3d. **Specific Comments on DEIS - Socioeconomics:** Pg. 203
 - 3e. **Comments on Socioeconomic Resources Technical Report (SRTR):** Pg. 205
 - 3f. **Comments on Reasonably Foreseeable Actions and Cumulative Effects Technical Report (RFACETR):** Pg. 206
4. **References for Part V:** Pg. 208

Appendix A: Contributors to City of Fort Collins NISP DEIS Comments (With Professional Biographies): Pg. 210

1. **City of Fort Collins Staff:** Pg. 210
2. **Outside Consultants:** Pg. 214

Appendix B: List of City of Fort Collins, Scientific and Legal Documents on Data Disc: Pg. 219

Appendix C: City of Fort Collins Natural Areas Program: Fort Collins Natural Areas Map: Pg. 221

Appendix D: List of Additional References Provided to Corps with Comments: Pg. 222