



**Climate Action Plan
Citizen Advisory Committee Minutes
October 9, 2014**

215 N. Mason Street, Community Room
5:30 p.m. – 9:00 p.m.

CAC Members: (X = present)

Bill DeMarco	X	Harry Edwards	X	Rich Fisher	X
Bryan Watkins	X	Holly Wright	X	Sara Frazier	X
Chadrick Martinez		John Holcombe	X	Chris O'Dell	X
Dana Villeneuve	X	Kellie Falbo		Stacey Clark	X
Dianne Ewing	X	Marge Moore	X	Suraj Renganathan	
Eric Levine	X	Kelly Giddens	X	Tom Ghidossi	X
Glen Colton	X	Mike Freeman		Yvonne Myers	X
Greg Rittner	X	Olivia Stowell			

In attendance:

Staff: John Phelan, Kathy Collier, Lucinda Smith, Emily Wilmsen, Bruce Hendee, Travis Paige, Melissa Hovey, Cassi Nichols, Paul Sizemore

Consultants: Becky Fedak - Brendle Group.

Facilitator: Art Bavoso

Guests: Mark Haudeshelt

Public Comment and Announcements

- Lucinda: We have a new member from the board of realtors, Greg Rittner, also James Mitchell with be the alternate from the board of realtors.
- Mark Haudeshelt wanted to comment on the criteria provided by Mark Easter in the last meeting. Mark wanted to say that additionality is critical in the power sector and in the transportation sector. He wants to know specifically whether the climate plan will overlap with or add to the PRPA planning and the CAFÉ standards. We may want to separate what's in the baseline and what's new. Mark is concerned with rebound effects associated with energy efficiency measures with vehicles and in buildings. Also, he wanted to bring up the importance and difficulties of measurement and reporting.
- Coreina explained that the Stepping Up Report is available, which is 77 pages, but there is also a one page summary that she made available.

Approval of September Minutes

- Stacey Clark moved and Yvonne Myers seconded a motion to approve the September 18, 2014 minutes. Motion passed unanimously.

Sample Strategy Analysis – Road to Zero Waste

- Coreina gave an overview, explaining how the tactics piece came together and the fact that the strategies are made up of tactics. She explained Palo Alto’s “moonshot goal” to reach net neutrality and carbon neutrality. In the case of Fort Collins, Coreina explained that RMI scaled up tactics in order to analyze tactics for the city’s CAP.
- Becky explained that the Road to Zero Waste program has been extensively developed by the City, so the strategies and tactics regarding waste are more straight forward. She also explained that the table shown at the previous meeting has been revised based off of some of the committee’s feedback.
- How does this CAP strategy discussion fit in with the current budget discussions?
 - Lucinda: The fact that the City and the community already have reduction goals means that we are already on the path to reducing emissions. As the Council is developing the budget for 2015 and 2016 they will have to weigh some of these issues. As staff, we have considered emission reduction goals in our budget proposals.
 - Bruce: Our City Council is driving this effort. The input provided here is critical and this current discussion will drive budget and ballot decisions.
- Where CAP funding was coming from and how this will affect future CAP decisions and programs. There was also a question about how to advocate for specific CAP goals.
 - Lucinda: The short written strategy descriptions for the CAP have existing and upcoming city programs. It’s certainly an option to advocate for a couple of things listed there.
 - Bruce: Most of the big things do happen on the biannual budget cycle, but we have BOB 2.0 to build on that in the near future. We also have an annual budget adjustment process.
- There was a question about how political capital could be used effectively in terms of the CAP and even specific CAP goals.
 - Bruce: We do need to be thinking about what the most important items are.
- To what extent can we help to drive that process so that we do not waste opportunities and political capital?
 - Becky: Some of these points are getting to our key questions.
- The City is developing a budget right now, so can we consider this process specifically with the Road to Zero Waste strategy?
 - Lucinda: 2013 began the plan to develop this Road to Zero Waste plan. There has been a lot of work and community conversation that can be put directly into this CAP model.
- Would it be helpful to have some concept of what the measures of progress would be for these strategies?

- That is not in there yet, so that is great feedback
- Is there a way to tell how the 2030 cost effectiveness numbers indicate how well we are doing?
 - We are starting to flesh that out more with the green, red and yellow. The colors are more indicative of status than the numbers. We are still working to convert the colored boxes into actual numbers. These current numbers are very draft.
- Again, in regards to the budget, is there a way we can enhance current considerations so that they align with CAP goals. Can we use current budget issues to aid in achieving goals so that we are not “recreating the wheel?”
- I like the colors but the numbers are misleading.
 - Becky: eventually the goal is to move away from ranges and still use the colors as well.
- The colors do not convince firmly sometimes.
- It is stated in the strategy that waste management companies will lose money picking up traditional waste, but then it says they will be making more money because of different services they can offer. People may not really see a decrease in their waste cost. This may be really expensive. More details on this strategy would help.
 - Becky: We are still working on these details and we will continue to do so in conjunction with the city.
 - Lucinda: Throughout the process we are working on partnerships to lessen this cost. The reality is we’re always going to be looking for the most cost effective approach. The Larimer County landfill is expected to last only 10 years, so there is a cost associated with closing that landfill and opening a new one.
 - It’s important to remember that following generations are particularly interested in methane emissions. This may be a public education issue.

Strategy Review and Discussion

- Becky gives an overview of the net zero buildings strategy.
- Coreina: Close to 60 tactics were discussed with experts. We asked “what is the best example you have seen of this and how could this look for Fort Collins.” Coreina then gives an overview of the tactics associated with green building of new construction.
 - When we’re talking about net zero energy is that for the building that is finally created, or does this include the entire construction process?
 - Coreina: For Fort Collins I think the construction process is important, but it’s usually dwarfed by the 20-30 years of operation following that. This is a good time to set a few guidelines, but the main focus should probably be on operations.
 - Is it better to have more or less new construction, is there a mix? Also, carrying capacity, do we have an end? Does the curve end at some point in terms of net zero?
 - We had a discussion about population and we said we would discuss various scenarios for population growth. There are some people that think that a high growth rate is not

necessarily good for the community. We really do need to look at different growth scenarios

- Lucinda: A few meetings ago we discussed the impact of changing population growth rates as a type of sensitivity analysis, and I think that is what you are referring to.
- Do we have enough land in the city for the 21,000 additional units that this is assuming?
 - Coreina: The city has put forth a projection and these numbers are for 2025 and 2035. On the other hand, the city does not have the data on commercial new growth.
- I think it would be really useful to have a statement in here regarding the average emissions of a building
- What feedback does the committee want from the public?
 - Would be nice for public to get a glimpse of this before it's too far along.
- Becky gives an overview of the land use strategy. This is looking at building in a way that reduces vehicle miles traveled.
- Coreina talks about the tactics associated with the land use strategy. The main goal is to discourage the use of single occupancy vehicles and there is a particular emphasis on parking.
 - does your plan provide or is it consistent with the idea of maintaining natural areas within a 10 min. walk of virtually anywhere in the city.
 - Lucinda: There is another strategy further down the list that talks about carbon sequestration and climate adaptation. That's where we thought we would put the *Nature in the City* strategy. The project planner is going to provide her projections and we can add this to the model.
 - These tactics are consistent with open space objectives because this is all about using space efficiently.
 - Development of free, wild space can really enhance neighborhoods.
 - My understanding is that there is a discussion regarding parking in city, should we not try to get in on this discussion and try to align it with the strategies here?
 - If we look at all of the costs, that by reducing the costs to the developer we're increasing the costs to the existing homeowners in the area. Letting economics drive that may not be the most effective way to manage our environment.
 - We need a strategy that includes options and alternatives to allow people to get where they need to go.
 - I'm really excited about the idea of a really robust bike share program.
 - Smart growth has always been a goal, but then some big developer comes in and this plan is put off. Fort Collins has all of these plans and Timnath does not, so it makes it difficult to it maintain an edge. It takes political will.
- Becky talks about efficiency in existing buildings, specifically in the residential sector. This involves behavior change and consumer choice.
- Coreina discusses tactics in this strategy and gives the impacts with and without the integrated utility services model.
 - How can we prove the model and attract investment?
 - The models are easy to adopt because they leverage money at scale.

- This was really concrete and that sparks my interest. We may need to have more concrete discussions to gain wide public support.
 - Becky: The information is there and we will eventually get to more of that detail.
 - Coreina: Working with upstream vendors is part of the detail in this.
 - Have you been talking to those participating in Georgetown? The strategies clearly align with the Georgetown application.
- Becky suggests that feedback from the committee is appreciated both in the form of personal reactions, but also from the perspective of the businesses and organizations that the committee members represent.
 - Coreina further discusses the integrated utility services model and specifically how it relates to the residential sector. She also shows a visual representation of the money and energy flow.
 - Do you know if that model has been used for residential rental units?
 - Right now this is mostly commercial, but the multi-family units may be a further consideration.
 - When we talk about commercial buildings sometimes we lose track of the retail and the restaurant sectors. The concept of having small businesses working as a group and working with popular sentiments may be beneficial.
 - Becky presents the multi-modal transportation strategy. This is specifically looking at ground travel.
 - Coreina discusses the opportunity to use technology, specifically smart phone technology to aid with this strategy. First priority is faster, cheaper, and more convenient.
 - It would be helpful to add the percentage of the overall goal for each strategy.
 - Suggested use of “slug-lines.”
 - This is especially relevant for Fort Collins where the majority of the residents live and work in the city. This also presents an opportunity to work with employers.
 - Suggestion to add health and safety considerations to these tactics.
 - Coreina: The triple bottom line considerations are tied to community health, so there is some of that in there.
 - Will we have 100% of our goal if we employ all of these strategies?
 - Lucinda: The objective is to have this plan achieve the goal. Most of these details are going out to 2030. This is a really high level, but there is a lot more detail there. You as the committee, will help decide which components are priority and which components we may want to leave out. The model also has a way to account for any double counting that may occur. It’s not going to be easy, but it’s not impossible to employ these strategies and meet CAP goals.
 - Becky: the goal of the next meeting is to go through these strategies with more detail including some assumptions and a scenario analysis.
 - A constant concern is pushing things out to another community. A big concern is regional commuting. I would like to see something in here about creating something in Fort Collins, such as another way to communicate, that cuts down on the commuting.
 - It seems that transportation is also an important revenue source. How would these strategies affect the budget?

- Paul: A big part of our transportation fund comes from a gas tax. It's not really related in any way to the amount of driving that's happening in Fort Collins. It's based on national gas taxes and then it is distributed by population. The real impact is affected more by national trends. There are conversations about this at the national level.

Strategy Review and Discussion (cont'd)

- Becky outlines load shifting specifically how to transition to more efficient vehicles. This strategy is also concerned with timing because electricity is still heavily reliant on coal, but this can shift to other sources.
- Coreina presents how electric vehicles can be cost effective and factors that can increase the use of electric vehicles.
 - Does this include using electric vehicles as an electric storage device?
 - Coreina: We had not considered that in our modeling. We are however looking at utility rates when charging your vehicle.
 - Rebates offered at purchase are enticing to consumers.
 - Coreina: These incentives are being considered along with timing.
 - Is there an opportunity for electric buses or other public transportation?
 - Coreina: that is the next slide. Northern Colorado has about 44% the national average of electric vehicle ownership.
 - The city could offer electric car shares.
- Becky discusses the commercial fleet strategy and says that efficiency in terms of electric vehicles and demand reductions have been added.
- Coreina: commercial fleets account for half of today's electric vehicle purchases nationally. We are looking at these fleets and aggregation of these fleets.
 - There may also be an intangible factor; the idea that it's "cool" to have an electric car.
- Becky: Energy supply strategy is a direct output of PRPA's model, so it's still to be determined.
- Coreina: The majority of this is about providing renewable energy and discussing various ownership models.
 - Is there an opportunity for electric buses or other public transportation
 - **John?** I think this is going to be a later conversation and something that will have to go into their financial model.
 - Coreina: The stage that we are talking about is in context of Fort Collins but these have not been fully vetted.
 - Is this the area with the biggest potential impact?
 - Coreina: this is a big chunk, but there's no silver bullet
 - At what point do we put our foot down and say we have to do this?
 - There is no piece of this that we can do without.
 - California has an even more aggressive standard, and there is a legislative and regulatory framework.
 - Arizona Public Service has a concentrated solar plant. We may consider this. It is also important to consider that the city of Fort Collins is part owner of PRPA.

- Becky: We have debated whether or not to combine or separate these next two strategies. We decided to split them to get at some of the tactics and we want feedback on this. The first is residential solar adoption and the second is advancing solar gardens and community scale solar.
- Coreina states that the goal is to ensure resident choice and comfort. She also explains how providing solar can be cost effective when done at a larger scale.
 - How does the current utility offer play in to this?
 - There are a lot of different ways to structure this.
 - If you have solar long-term as a homeowner it works, but it may not work as well for rentals or more temporary situations.
 - We have to also consider whether the equipment stays with the person or the home.
 - I would argue in favor of combining them for implementation purposes.
- Becky introduces the switching heating loads strategy.
- Coreina explains how this strategy and tactics came to be and how we can begin to think about eliminating coal.
 - Issue of healthy homes and inside space
 - Is this the area where you are including district energy systems?
 - Coreina: Yes, but this is a small assumption
 - How efficient are heat pumps compared to other options?
 - What are the opportunities for various industries?
 - Project Revive
- Becky explains eco-districts/catalyst zones, sequestration/ adaptation and social mobilization. She states that we now have Eco-Districts/Catalyst Zones included but not analyzed quantitatively in order to prevent double counting.
- Coreina explores the idea of “climate currency.”
 - Kathy: The City has done this in terms of transportation.
 - In the local food cluster we see that there is a lot of opportunity in the schools. We could have community gardens at schools and hopefully this will also spill over into actions at home too.

Recap and Next Steps

- Connection between Brendle Group and RMI modeling and engagement
- How to further involve community
 - HOAs
 - Schools
 - Public Forum
 - Wellness Fairs
 - CSU Extension
 - be specific and concrete
 - groups can request discussions
 - churches
 - DVD
 - Emily: we have a clip on the CAP online
 - Cartoonist
 - Personalize the message